Exhibit B

	T	1	l	wasning	ton v. DHS, No. 1	.9-5210 (E.D. Wash.), Privi	lege Log	3	
Control No.	Production Begin Bates	Production End Bates	DOCDATE	То	FROM	сс	всс	TAG - Privilege	TAG - Privilege Description
1	AR_00380288	AR_00380288	7/30/2019	Kevin McAleenan	Quinn, Cameron	Wales, Brandon; Boyd, Valerie; Mitnick, John; Cuccinelli, Ken		DP - Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Predecisional, deliberative email sharing predecisional, deliberative recommendations regarding the public charge rule for consideration by Acting Secretary. Contains employee phone numbers and email addresses.
2	AR_00380289	AR_00380289	6/24/2019	Kevin McAleenan	Quinn, Cameron	Wales, Brandon; Boyd, Valerie; Mitnick, John; Cuccinelli, Ken		DP - Deliberative Process	Predecisional, deliberative document from Civil Rights and Civil Liberties Officer containing predecisional, deliberative recommendations regarding the public charge rule for consideration by Acting Secretary.
3	AR 00380290	AR 00380290	7/16/2019	Scott Glabe; Kevin McAleenan	McDonald, Christina	Wales, Brandon; Boyd, Valerie; Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph; Mizelle, Chad; Fishman, George; Best, Natalia		ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process	Predecisional, deliberative document from agency counsel to the Acting Secretary regardin various draft immigration rulemakings, including the public charge rule.
	AR_00380291	AR_00380291		Kevin McAleenan	Scott Glabe	Wales, Brandon; Boyd, Valerie; Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph; Mizelle, Chad; Fishman, George; McDonald, Christina; Best, Natalia			Predecisional, deliberative document from agency counsel to the Acting Secretary regardiny various draft immigration rulemakings, including the public charge rule.
5	AR_00380292	AR_00380292	7/17/2019	Maher, Joseph; Fishman, George; Mizelle, Chad; McDonald, Christina; Baroukh, Nader	Unspecified Sender			AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental impressions and legal advice in anticipation of litigation. This document contains pre-decisiona and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized.
6	AR 00380293	AR 00380293	7/11/2010	Zadrozny, John	John Mitnick			, , ,	Email discussion between USCIS Deputy Chief o Staff to DHS Office of General Counsel including predecisional deliberations regarding forms associated with the public charge rule, and
-	AR 00380294	AR 00380294		McDonald, Christina; DHS Attorney Advisor	John Mitnick				seeking legal advice regarding those forms. Memorandum from USCIS Chief of Policy and Strategy to DHS General Counsel Memo containing predecisional, deliberative communications regarding the public charge rulemaking process sent for the purposes of legal advice.
	AR_00380295	AR_00380295		Brandon Wales	John Mitnick			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	Email discussion between DHS Office of General Counsel and USCIS containing predecisional, deliberations regarding the public charge rulemaking and legal advice. Contains employee phone numbers and email addresses and staff level names.
9	AR_00380296	AR_00380296	7/5/2019	McDonald, Christina	John Mitnick	DHS Attorney Advisor; Mizelle, Chad; Maher, Joseph; Fishman, George; Baroukh, Nader			Email between attorneys within the Office of General Counsel including legal opinions and deliberative communications regarding the public charge rulemaking process. Contains employee phone numbers and email addresses and staff level names.

		,						
								Draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel
								to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice
								regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
								litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	
							· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
4.0			_ /- /				Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and advice about agency decisions that have not
10	AR_00380297	AR_00380297	7/3/2019	Cuccinelli, Ken	John Mitnick		Deliberative Process	yet been finalized.
								Email communication within the DHS Office of
								the General Counsel including deliberative
						DHS Attorney Advisors; DHS Special		communications and legal discussions regarding
						Assistant; Browne, Rene; Baroukh,	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	the public charge rulemaking. Contains
				McDonald, Christina; Mizelle,		Nader; Maher, Joseph; Fishman,	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	employee phone numbers and email addresses
11	AR 00380298	AR 00380298	7/1/2019		John Mitnick	George	Privacy	and names of staff level employees.
			,,,				,	Email communication within the DHS Office of
								the General Counsel including deliberative
						Missile Chad Brauns Bare		_
						Mizelle, Chad; Browne, Rene;	ACD ALL	communications and legal discussions regarding
						Baroukh, Nader; Maher, Joseph;	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	the public charge rulemaking. Contains phone
						Fishman, George; DHS Attorney	1 '	numbers and email address of agency employee
12	AR_00380299	AR_00380299	6/28/2019	McDonald, Christina	John Mitnick	Advisors	Privacy	and names of staff-level employees.
								This email reflects discussions between agency
								counsel and USCIS regarding legal advice
								concerning the public charge rule. It contains a
								pre-decisional deliberative conversation
						Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Fishman,		regarding recommendations and advice
						George; Mitnick, John; DHS	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	pertaining to the public charge rule. Contains
						Attorney Advisor; DHS OGC	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	employee phone numbers and the names of
12	AR 00380300	AR 00380300	0/20/2010	Shah, Dimple	DUC Attornov Advisor	Economist	Privacy	staff level employees.
15	AK_00360300	AK_00380300	6/29/2016	Shari, Dirriple	DHS Attorney Advisor	Economist	Privacy	
								This email reflects discussions between agency
								counsel and USCIS regarding legal advice
								concerning the public charge rule. It contains a
								pre-decisional deliberative conversation
								regarding recommendations and advice
						Fishman, George; Mitnick, John;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	pertaining to the public charge rule. Contains
						DHS Attorney Advisors; DHS OGC	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	employee phone numbers and the names of
14	AR 00380301	AR 00380301	8/29/2018	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy	Shah, Dimple	Economist	Privacy	staff level employees.
T		_	. ,	,,			<u> </u>	This email reflects discussions between agency
								counsel and USCIS regarding legal advice
								concerning the public charge rule. It contains a
								pre-decisional deliberative conversation
								regarding recommendations and advice
						Fishman, George; Mitnick, John;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	pertaining to the public charge rule. Contains
1				DHS Attorney Advisor; Shah,		DHS Attorney Advisors; DHS OGC	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	employee phone numbers and the names of
15	AR_00380302	AR_00380302	8/29/2018	Dimple	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy	Economist	Privacy	staff level employees.
								This email reflects discussions between agency
1								counsel and USCIS regarding legal advice
								concerning the public charge rule. It contains a
1								pre-decisional deliberative conversation
								regarding recommendations and advice
						Fishman Coorgo, Mitnisk Jahar	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	pertaining to the public charge rule. Contains
				Shah Dissalar Nusahal Karasali		Fishman, George; Mitnick, John;	1	
	1	1	l	Shah, Dimple; Nuebel Kovarik,		DHS Attorney Advisors; DHS OGC		employee phone numbers and the names of
	AR 00380303	AR 00380303	8/29/2018	Markley .	DHS Attorney Advisor	Economist	Privacy	staff level employees.

								This email reflects discussions between agency counsel regarding legal advice concerning the public charge rule. It contains a pre-decisional deliberative conversation regarding recommendations and advice pertaining to the
						Fishman, George; Mitnick, John; DHS Attorney Advisors; DHS OGC	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	public charge rule. Contains employee phone numbers and the names of staff level
17	AR_00380304	AR_00380304	8/29/2018	DHS Attorney Advisor	Shah, Dimple	Economist	Privacy	employees.
18	AR 00380305	AR 00380305	8/23/2018	Mitnick, John	Shah, Dimple			Email containing discussions between agency counsel regarding legal advice and analysis concerning the public charge rule. This email contains a pre-decisional deliberative conversation regarding recommendations and advice pertaining to the public charge rule. Contains employee phone numbers and the names of staff level employees.
10	AN_00380303	AI_00300303	0/23/2010	Wildrick, John	Silari, Dirripie		Trivacy	Email discussion between Office of General
19	AR_00380306	AR_00380306	8/21/2018	Symons, Craig M; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; USCIS Chief, Regulatory Coordination Division; DHS Attorney Advisor	Law, Robert T	Mitnick, John; Shah, Dimple; DHS Attorney Advisor; DHS OGC Economist	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Counsel and agency leadership containing predecisional, deliberations and reflecting legal advice concerning a scheduled discussion regarding the public charge rule. Contains email addresses and phone numbers, and names of staff-level employees.
20	AR_00380307	AR_00380307	9/10/2018	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George	DHS Attorney Advisor	Maher, Joseph; DHS Attorney Advisors; DHS OGC Economist; Baroukh, Nader; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Symons, Craig M; USCIS Chief, Regulatory Coordination Division; DHS Deputy Associate General Counsel		Deliberative predecisional email discussing proposed edits and comments regarding the draft rule, and reflecting internal discussion and deliberation among DHS personnel, including DHS counsel, regarding those proposed changes. This email contains legal advice, comment, and discussion provided by DHS counsel regarding questions related to the development of the draft rule and proposed changes to that draft. This email contains PII requiring redaction.
							AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	Email discussion between agency counsel and DHS leadership discussing legal advice relating to public charge rule, made in anticipation of litigation. The email chain contains deliberations regarding the rule, including legal advice.
21	AR_00380308	AR_00380308	9/9/2018	Mitnick, John	Taylor, Miles	Wolf, Chad	Privacy	Contains emails and phone numbers.
22	AR 00380309	AR 00380309	9/9/2019	Mitnick, John	Taylor, Miles	Wolf, Chad	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Email discussion between agency counsel and Deputy Chief of Staff discussing legal risks relating to public charge rule, made in anticipation of litigation. The email chain contains deliberations regarding litigation risk. Contains emails and phone numbers.
	5050000	0000000	3,3,2310	,		,		TELLES ELIGIDANA PROTECTION DELL'A

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 5 of 26

23	AR_00380310	AR_00380310	9/7/2018	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George	DHS Attorney Advisor	Maher, Joseph; DHS OGC Economist; Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy Associate General Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisors; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Symons, Craig M; USCIS Chief, Regulatory Coordination Division	, -	This email chain between DHS counsel and DHS's General Counsel, and including senior USCIS leadership including USCIS's Chief Counsel, contains opinions, recommendations, and requests for further information regarding the drafting of the public charge rule. Counsel offer legal advice and comment related to the drafting of the rule. Contains emails, phone numbers, and the names of staff-level employees.
24	AR_00380311	AR_00380311	9/6/2018	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George	DHS Attorney Advisor	Maher, Joseph; DHS OGC Economist; DHS Attorney Advisors; Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy Associate General Counsel; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Symons, Craig M; USCIS Chief, Regulatory Coordination Division	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	This email chain between DHS counsel and DHS's General Counsel, and including senior USCIS leadership including USCIS's Chief Counsel, contains opinions, recommendations, and requests for further information regarding the drafting of the public charge rule. Counsel offer legal advice and comment related to the drafting of the rule. Contains emails, phone numbers, and the names of staff-level employees.
25	AR_00380312	AR_00380312	9/6/2018	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George	DHS Attorney Advisor	Maher, Joseph; DHS OGC Economist; DHS Attorney Advisors; Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy Associate General Counsel; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Symons, Craig M; USCIS Chief, Regulatory Coordination Division	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft, deliberative predecisional document shared between DHS counsel and DHS's General Counsel and other DHS and USCIS personnel regarding development of public charge rule and including comments and recommendations by counsel.
26	AR_00380313	AR_00380313	9/6/2018	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George	DHS Attorney Advisor	Maher, Joseph; DHS OGC Economist; DHS Attorney Advisors; Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy Associate General Counsel; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Symons, Craig M; USCIS Chief, Regulatory Coordination Division	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Deliberative, predecisional document shared between DHS counsel and DHS's General Counsel and other DHS and USCIS personnel regarding development of public charge rule and including comments and recommendations by counsel.
27	AR_00380314	AR_00380314	9/4/2018	John Mitnick	George Fishman		ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Deliberative predecisional email chain among senior DHS personnel, including DHS's General Counsel and other DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding review and drafting. Contains email addresses and phone numbers.
28	AR_00380315	AR_00380315	9/4/2018	John Mitnick	George Fishman		ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	Deliberative predecisional email chain among senior DHS personnel, including DHS's General Counsel and other DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding review and drafting. Contains email addresses and phone numbers.

29	AR_00380316	AR_00380316	9/4/2018	John Mitnick	George Fishman		ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Deliberative predecisional email chain among senior DHS personnel, including DHS's General Counsel and other DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding review and drafting. Contains email addresses and phone numbers.
30	AR_00380317	AR_00380317	9/3/2018	McDonald, Christina; Mitnick, John	DHS Attorney Advisor	Fishman, George; Maher, Joseph; DHS Attorney Advisor; Baroukh, Nader	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Deliberative predecisional email chain among senior DHS personnel, including DHS's General Counsel and other DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding review and drafting. Contains email addresses, phone numbers, and staff-level names.
31	AR_00380318	AR_00380318	9/3/2018	Baroukh, Nader; Fishman, George	DHS Attorney Advisor	DHS Attorney Advisors		Deliberative predecisional email chain among DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding how to proceed with review and drafting. Contains email addresses, phone numbers, and names of staff-level employees.
32	AR_00380319	AR_00380319	9/3/2018	DHS Attorney Advisor; Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Fishman, George; Maher, Joseph		Deliberative predecisional email chain among senior DHS personnel, including DHS's General Counsel and other DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding review and drafting. Contains email addresses, phone numbers, and staff-level names.
33	AR_00380320	AR_00380320	9/3/2018	Mitnick, John	Wolf, Chad	McDonald, Christina; Fishman, George; Cissna, Francis; Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Stoddard, Kaitlin V; Taylor, Miles	,	Deliberative predecisional email chain among senior DHS personnel, including DHS's General Counsel and other DHS counsel discussing the status of the draft rule and providing recommendations, opinions, and legal advice regarding review and drafting. Contains email addresses and phone numbers.
34	AR_00380321	AR_00380321	7/5/2018	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Shah, Dimple; Baroukh, Nader; Maher, Joseph; Palmer, David		Email chain within the DHS Office of the General Counsel reflecting deliberative discussions regarding the public charge rulemaking. The emails contain discussions of the contents of the public charge rule, comments on the rule, and legal analysis. Contains email addresses and phone numbers.
35	AR_00380322	AR_00380322	7/3/2018	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Shah, Dimple; Baroukh, Nader; Maher, Joseph; Palmer, David		Email chain within the DHS Office of the General Counsel reflecting deliberative discussions regarding the public charge rulemaking. The emails contain discussions of the contents of the public charge rule, comments on the rule, and legal analysis. Contains email addresses and phone numbers.

	ı	1	1		T			
								Email chain within the DHS Office of the General
								Counsel reflecting deliberative discussions
								regarding the public charge rulemaking. The
								emails contain discussions of the contents of the
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	public charge rule, comments on the rule, and
						Shah, Dimple; Baroukh, Nader;		legal analysis. Contains email addresses and
36	AR 00380323	AR 00380323	7/3/2018	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Maher, Joseph	Privacy	phone numbers.
30	AN_00380323	AI_00380323	7/3/2018	Wittilek, John	IVICDONAIA, CHITISCHIA	Waller, Joseph	Tilvacy	Memorandum from the DHS Office of the
								General Counsel reflecting deliberations and
								legal advice regarding the public charge
								rulemaking. The memo contains discussions of
						Shah, Dimple; Baroukh, Nader;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	the contents of the public charge rule,
37	AR_00380324	AR_00380324	7/3/2018	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Maher, Joseph	Deliberative Process	comments on the rule, and legal analysis.
								Emails sharing predecisional, deliberative
								recommendations regarding the public charge
								rule for consideration by Acting Secretary.
						Boyd, Valerie; Mitnick, John;	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	Contains employee phone numbers and email
20	A.D. 00200225	A.D. 00200225	7/20/2040	Malas Bassalas	0 1 6			
38	AR_00380325	AR_00380325	//30/2019	Wales, Brandon	Quinn, Cameron	Nichols, Kate; Kaplan, Sam	Personal Privacy	addresses.
								Predecisional, deliberative document from Civil
								Rights and Civil Liberties Officer containing
								predecisional, deliberative recommendations
						Boyd, Valerie; Mitnick, John;		regarding the public charge rule for
39	AR_00380326	AR_00380326	6/24/2019	Wales, Brandon	Quinn, Cameron	Nichols, Kate; Kaplan, Sam	DP - Deliberative Process	consideration by Acting Secretary.
								Memorandum from DHS General Counsel to the
								Acting Secretary containing legal advice
								regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
								litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
							ANA/D. NA/ards Danidors ACD	-
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
			4 4			Palmer, David; Mitnick, John; DHS		and advice about agency decisions that have not
40	AR_00380327	AR_00380327	7/29/2019	Executive Secretary	Special Assistant	Deputy Managing Counsel	Deliberative Process	yet been finalized.
								Email discussion within DHS including DHS Office
								of General Counsel containing predecisional,
								deliberations regarding the process for finalizing
								the public charge rule and seeking legal advice
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	regarding the rule. Contains employee phone
								numbers and email addresses and staff-level
11	AR 00380328	AR 00380328	7/6/2010	Scott Glabe	John Mitnick		Privacy	names.
41	7.11_30300320	00300320	7,0,2013	Journal of the Control of the Contro	John Wildrick		····acy	Email discussion within DHS including DHS Office
								_
								of General Counsel containing predecisional,
								deliberations regarding the process for finalizing
								the public charge rule and seeking legal advice
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	regarding the rule. Contains employee phone
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	numbers and email addresses and staff-level
42	AR_00380329	AR_00380329	7/6/2019	Scott Glabe	John Mitnick		Privacy	names.
								Draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel
								to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice
								regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
1		ı	ı		1			litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
						I I		
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
	AR 00380330	AR 00380330		Brandon Wales	John Mitnick		Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized.

Email discussion within DHS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem Privacy ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem Privacy Email discussion within DHS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem Privacy Email discussion within DHS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contains employee phone of General Counsel	ining ing the public g issues, and naking numbers and es. g DHS Office ining ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald; Joseph Maher ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DRS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contai process. Contains employee phone r email addresses and staff-level name ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r email addresses and staff-level name ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r email addresses and staff-level name ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DRS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contai predecisional, deliberations regardin charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r offering legal advice regarding rulem offering legal advices.	ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and es. g DHS Office ining ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald; John Mitnick Joseph Maher Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald; John Mitnick Joseph Maher ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Offering legal advice regarding rulem process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name pr	g issues, and naking numbers and es. If the public g issues, and naking numbers and naking numbers and naking numbers and
Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. AR_00380332	naking numbers and es. ng DHS Office ining ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
Privacy Email addresses and staff-level name AR_00380331 AR_00380332 AR_00380332 Z/20/2019 Claire Grady John Mitnick Joseph Maher Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald; Joseph Maher Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald; Privacy email addresses and staff-level name ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem Privacy email addresses and staff-level name ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem Privacy email addresses and staff-level name ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem Privacy email addresses and staff-level name Bemail discussion within DHS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contai predecisional, deliberations regarding horizonal deliberation	numbers and es. ng DHS Office ining ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
44 AR_00380331 AR_00380331 2/20/2019 Claire Grady John Mitnick Joseph Maher Privacy email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name process. AR_00380332 AR_00380332 2/20/2019 Christina McDonald John Mitnick Joseph Maher Privacy Email discussion within DHS including of General Counsel and USCIS contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name and the process and the proce	es. Ing DHS Office Ining Ing the public Ing issues, and Inaking Inumbers and
Email discussion within DHS includin of General Counsel and USCIS contai predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name email addresses and staff-level name email addresses and staff-level name email addresses and usceptional predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem Milles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name email addresses and staff-level name and usceptional predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem beliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remailed to the process of the p	ng DHS Office ining ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulemaking. Including staffing ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulemaking. Including staffing Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including of General Counsel and USCIS contain of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone representations of General Counsel and USCIS contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process. Contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process. Contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process contains employee phone representations regarding rulemaking. Including staffing the process contains employee phone representations are process. Process of the process contains employee phone representations are process. Process of the process contains employee phone representations are process. Process of the process contains employee phone representations are process. Process process contains employee phone representations are process. Process process contains employee phone representations are process. Process proc	ining ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including staffing of Geral Counsel and USCIS contains regarding rulem ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including of Geral Counsel and USCIS contains regarding rulem predecisional, deliberations regarding rulem Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone repredecisional, deliberations regarding rulem process. Contains employee phone repredecisional pr	ng the public g issues, and naking numbers and
ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy Email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including staffing of Gering legal advice regarding rulem process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including of Gering Legal advice regarding rulem process. Contains employee phone remail addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including of Gering Legal advice regarding rulem predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing have been designed in the process of the pro	g issues, and naking numbers and
ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS includin of General Counse and USCIS contains regarding rulem of General Counse and USCIS contains employee phone of General Counse and USCIS contains employee and USCIS contains employee and USCIS contains employee phone of Counse and USCIS contains employee phone of General Counse and USCIS contains employee phone of Counse employee phone of Counse and USCIS contains employee phone of Counse e	naking numbers and
AR_00380332 AR_00380332 2/20/2019 Christina McDonald John Mitnick Joseph Maher Privacy email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including of General Counsel and USCIS contain repedicisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Privacy email addresses and staff-level name of General Counsel and USCIS contain prodecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing the process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone of Deli	numbers and
45 AR_00380332 AR_00380332 2/20/2019 Christina McDonald John Mitnick Joseph Maher Privacy email addresses and staff-level name Email discussion within DHS including of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone results of the contains employee phone of the c	
Email discussion within DHS including of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone results of the contains and process. Contains employee phone results of the co	es.
of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	
of General Counsel and USCIS contain predecisional, deliberations regarding charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	ng DHS Office
predecisional, deliberations regardin charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	•
charge rulemaking, including staffing Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	-
Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	
Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	
	-
46 AR 00380333 AR 00380333 2/20/2019 Claire Grady John Mitnick Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald Privacy email addresses and staff-level name	
Email discussion within DHS includin	
of General Counsel and USCIS contai	•
predecisional, deliberations regardin	•
charge rulemaking, including staffing	
Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem	
Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum; Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	-
47 AR 00380334 AR 00380334 2/19/2019 Claire Grady John Mitnick Francis Cissna; Christina McDonald Privacy email addresses and staff-level name	
Email discussion within DHS includin	
of General Counsel and USCIS contai	
predecisional, deliberations regardin	
charge rulemaking, including staffing	
ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP offering legal advice regarding rulem	
Claire Grady; Kate Nichols; Brandon Deliberative Process; PII - Personal process. Contains employee phone r	
48 AR_00380335 AR_00380335 2/19/2019 Miles Taylor John Mitnick Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum Privacy email addresses and staff-level name	
46 AR_00360333 AR_00360333 2/13/2013 Whites Taylor John Willink Wales, San Rapian, Chip Fulgitum Privacy Email discussion with DHS Office of C	
Counsel and USCIS containing prede	
deliberations regarding the public ch	-
ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP rulemaking and legal advice. Contain	
Deliberative Process; PII - Personal phone numbers and email addresses 49 AR 00380336 AR 00380336 2/15/2019 Francis Cissna John Mitnick Privacy level names.	s anu Stan
	CI
Email discussion with DHS Office of C	
Counsel and USCIS containing prede	
deliberations and legal advice regard	-
ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP public charge rulemaking. Contains e	
Deliberative Process; PII - Personal phone numbers and email addresses	s and staff
50 AR_00380337 AR_00380337 2/15/2019 Francis Cissna John Mitnick Privacy level names.	
Email discussion with DHS Office of C	General
Counsel and USCIS containing prede	
deliberations and legal advice regard	ding the
deliberations and legal advice regard Jospeh Maher; George Fishman; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP public charge rulemaking. Contains of	ding the employee
deliberations and legal advice regard	ding the employee

								Email chain with DHS counsel containing
								predecisional deliberative discussions regarding the contents of a memorandum regarding the
								public charge rule, and containing legal advice
								regarding the rulemaking process made in
						John Mitnick; George Fishman;	Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	anticipation of litigation. Contains email addresses, phone numbers, and the names of
52	AR 00380339	AR 00380339	7/28/2019	Chad Mizelle	Christina McDonald	Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh	Privacy	staff-level employees.
			, -, -			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		Email chain with DHS counsel containing
								predecisional deliberative discussions regarding
								the contents of a memorandum regarding the
								public charge rule, and containing legal advice
							AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	regarding the rulemaking process made in anticipation of litigation. Contains email
						John Mitnick; George Fishman;		addresses, phone numbers, and the names of
53	AR 00380340	AR 00380340	7/28/2019	Chad Mizelle	Christina McDonald	Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh	Privacy	staff-level employees.
								Email chain with DHS counsel containing
								predecisional deliberative discussions regarding
								the contents of a memorandum regarding the
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	public charge rule, and containing legal advice regarding the rulemaking process made in
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	anticipation of litigation. Contains email
						John Mitnick; George Fishman;	, , , ,	addresses, phone numbers, and the names of
54	AR_00380341	AR_00380341	7/27/2019	Christina McDonald	Chad Mizelle	Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh	Privacy	staff-level employees.
								Email chain between DHS counsel and DHS
								leadership containing predecisional deliberative
								discussions regarding the contents of a
								memorandum regarding the public charge rule, and containing legal advice regarding the
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	rulemaking process made in anticipation of
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	litigation. Contains email addresses, phone
						John Mitnick; George Fishman;	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	numbers, and the names of staff-level
55	AR_00380342	AR_00380342	7/27/2019	Chad Mizelle	Christina McDonald	Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh	Privacy	employees.
								Email chain between DHS counsel and DHS
								leadership containing predecisional deliberative
								discussions regarding the contents of a memorandum regarding the public charge rule,
								and containing legal advice regarding the
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	rulemaking process made in anticipation of
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	litigation. Contains email addresses, phone
						John Mitnick; George Fishman;	,	numbers, and the names of staff-level
56	AR_00380343	AR_00380343	7/27/2019	Christina McDonald	Chad Mizelle	Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh	Privacy	employees.
								Email chain with DHS counsel containing predecisional deliberative discussions regarding
								the contents of a memorandum regarding the
								public charge rule, and containing legal advice
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	regarding the rulemaking process made in
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	anticipation of litigation. Contains email
						John Mitnick; George Fishman;		addresses, phone numbers, and the names of
57	AR_00380344	AR_00380344	7/27/2019	Chad Mizelle	Christina McDonald	Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh	Privacy	staff-level employees.

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 10 of 26

									Email between DHS General Counsel and agency leadership including predecisional, deliberative
								ACP - Attorney Client Privilege: DP	discussion and legal analysis of the draft public
									charge rule. Conatins email addresses and
	58	AR 00380345	AR 00380345	7/27/2019	John Mitnick	Brandon Wales	Valerie Boyd	Privacy	phone numbers.
	- 50			., = . , = = = =			10.00.000		Email chain between DHS counsel and DHS
									leadership containing predecisional deliberative
									discussions regarding the contents of a
									memorandum regarding the public charge rule,
									and containing legal advice regarding the
							George Fishman; Joseph Maher;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	rulemaking process. Contains email addresses,
					John Mitnick; Christina		Nader Baroukh; DHS OGC	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	phone numbers, and the names of staff-level
	59	AR_00380346	AR_00380346	7/27/2019	McDonald; Brandon Wales	Chad Mizelle	Economist; Scott Glabe	Privacy	employees.
									Email chain between DHS counsel and DHS
									leadership containing predecisional deliberative
									discussions regarding the contents of a
									memorandum regarding the public charge rule,
									and containing legal advice regarding the
							George Fishman; Joseph Maher;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	rulemaking process. Contains email addresses,
					John Mitnick; Christina		Nader Baroukh; DHS OGC	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	phone numbers, and the names of staff-level
	60	AR_00380347	AR_00380347	7/27/2019	McDonald; Brandon Wales	Chad Mizelle	Economist; Scott Glabe	Privacy	employees.
									Email chain between DHS counsel and DHS
									leadership containing predecisional deliberative
									discussions regarding the contents of a
									memorandum regarding the public charge rule,
									and containing legal advice regarding the
							Chad Mizelle; George Fishman;		rulemaking process. Contains email addresses,
							Joseph Maher; Nader Baroukh;		phone numbers, and the names of staff-level
	61	AR_00380348	AR_00380348	7/27/2019	John Mitnick; Brandon Wales	Christina McDonald	DHS OGC Economist; Scott Glabe	Privacy	employees.
									Email chain between DHS counsel and DHS
									leadership containing predecisional deliberative
									discussions regarding the contents of a
									memorandum regarding the public charge rule,
								ACD Attacase Client Dri ileas DD	and containing legal advice regarding the
									rulemaking process. Contains email addresses,
	63	AR 00380349	AR 00380349	7/27/2010	John Mitnick	Brandon Wales	Valerie Boyd		phone numbers, and the names of staff-level
-	62	An_00300349	An_00360349	//2//2019	JOHN WHEHICK	DI ATIUUTI VVAIES	valetie buyu	Privacy	employees. Deliberative, predecisional email chain among
									senior DHS and USCIS personnel discussing the
									status and timeline for completing review and
							Brandon Wales; John Mitnick;		revision of the draft rule, and providing
							George Fishman; Kathy Nuebel	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege: DD	recommendations and advice regarding how to
	63	AR 00380350	AR 00380350	3/8/2019	Miles Taylor	John Gountanis	Kovarik; Assistant	Deliberative Process	proceed.
	03	30300330	00300330	3, 0, 2013	co .ayıoı	John Godinanis	novaling / Bolotonic	Deliberative Frocess	Deliberative, predecisional email chain among
									senior DHS and USCIS personnel discussing the
									status and timeline for completing review and
							Brandon Wales; John Mitnick;		revision of the draft rule, and providing
							George Fishman; Kathy Nuebel	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	
	64	AR 00380351	AR 00380351	3/8/2019	John Gountanis	Miles Taylor	Kovarik; Assistant	Deliberative Process	proceed.
_		_				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1	L	l'

		1	1		Т			
65	AR_00380352	AR_00380352	2/20/2019	John Mitnick	Claire Grady	Miles Taylor; Kate Nichols; Brandon Wales; Sam Kaplan; Chip Fulghum		Email discussion within DHS including DHS Office of General Counsel and USCIS containing predecisional, deliberations regarding the public charge rulemaking, including staffing issues, and offering legal advice regarding rulemaking process. Contains employee phone numbers and email addresses and staff-level names. Email containing predecisional, deliberative
66	AR_00380353	AR_00380353	12/19/2018	John Mitnick	George Fishman		DP - Deliberative Process	recommendation regarding public charge rule.
67	AR_00380354	AR_00380354	8/29/2018	DHS Attorney Advisor; Shah, Dimple	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy	DHS Attorney Advisor; Fishman, George; DHS OGC Economist; Mitnick, John	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	This email includes discussions between agency counsel and leadership regarding legal advice concerning the public charge rule. This email contains a pre-decisional deliberative conversation regarding recommendations and advice pertaining to the public charge rule. This email contains employee phone numbers and the names of staff level employees.
68	AR_00380355	AR_00380355	7/28/2019	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Mizelle, Chad; Fishman, George; Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Pre-decisional communications containing legal analysis regarding legal memorandum on the public charge regulation, between DHS Office of the General Counsel. The document reflects legal advice, mental impressions of attorney, and advice in anticipation of litigation. Also includes staff level names, phone numbers, and emails.
69	AR_00380356	AR_00380356	7/28/2019	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Mizelle, Chad; Fishman, George; Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental impressions and legal advice in anticipation of litigation. This document contains pre-decisional and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized.
70	AR_00380357	AR_00380357	7/26/2019	Wales, Brandon	John Mitnick	Boyd, Valerie	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process	Email communication with DHS leadership and DHS General Counsel reflecting legal advice and attorney mental impressions regarding the public charge rule. This communication contains pre-decisional and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized. Includes staff phone numbers.
71	AR_00380358	AR_00380358	7/1/2019	Mizelle, Chad	McDonald, Christina	DHS Attorney Advisors; Browne, Rene; Baroukh, Nader; Maher, Joseph; Mitnick, John; Fishman, George; DHS Special Assistant	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft memorandum from DHS Deputy General Counsel to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental impressions and legal advice in anticipation of litigation. This document contains pre-decisional and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized.

	ı	1	1	ı	1	,		1
		1						Draft memorandum from DHS OGC to the Acting
								Secretary containing legal advice regarding the
								Rule and attorney mental impressions and legal
								advice in anticipation of litigation. This
						DHS Attorney Advisors; Browne,		document contains pre-decisional and
						Rene; Baroukh, Nader; Maher,	AWP - Work Product; ACP -	deliberative opinions, recommendations, and
						Joseph; Mitnick, John; Fishman,	Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	advice about agency decisions that have not yet
72	AR 00380359	AD 00300350	7/1/2010	MaDanald Christina	Minalla Chad			_ ,
12	AR_00380359	AR_00380359	//1/2019	McDonald, Christina	Mizelle, Chad	George	Deliberative Process	been finalized.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain among
								attorneys regarding memo explaining the public
						DHS Attorney Advisors; Browne,		charge final rule. Contains discussion regarding
						Rene; Baroukh, Nader; Maher,	AWP - Work Product; ACP -	recommendation to approve the rule and legal
				McDonald, Christina; Mizelle,		Joseph; Fishman, George; DHS	Attorney Client Privilege; PII -	assessment of the rule. Contains email
73	AR 00380360	AR 00380360	7/1/2019	Chad	Mitnick, John	Special Assistant	Personal Privacy	addresses and names of staff-level employees.
	_	_			,		•	Deliberative email between DHS OGC attorneys
								and DHS senior official regarding the public
								,
								charge rule, including comments and advice
		1						regarding key aspects of the draft version of the
							*	final rule. Contains email addresses and the
74	AR_00380361	AR_00380361	6/12/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Mitnick, John		Privacy	names of staff-level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email between DHS
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	OGC attorneys regarding timeline for publication
75	AR_00380362	AR_00380362	12/19/2018	Fishman, George	Mitnick, John		Deliberative Process	of the public charge rule.
								Pre-decisional communications containing legal
								analysis regarding legal memorandum on the
								public charge regulation between DHS Office of
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	the General Counsel. The document reflects
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	legal advice, mental impressions of attorney, and
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	advice in anticipation of litigation. Also includes
76	AR 00380363	AR 00380363	7/12/2019	Mitnick, John	DHS Attorney Advisor	McDonald, Christina	Privacy	staff level names, phone numbers, and emails.
- 70			.,,					Draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel
								to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice
								regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
								litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
		1					AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and advice about agency decisions that have not
77	AR_00380364	AR_00380364	7/11/2019	Mitnick, John	DHS Attorney Advisor	McDonald, Christina	Deliberative Process	yet been finalized.
								Pre-decisional communications containing legal
		ĺ						analysis regarding legal memorandum on the
		1						public charge regulation between DHS Office of
							AM/D Mark Draduct ACS	l'
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	the General Counsel. Document reflects legal
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	advice, mental impressions of attorneys, and
				McDonald, Christina; Mitnick,			Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	advice in anticipation of litigation. Also includes
78	AR_00380365	AR_00380365	7/11/2019	John	DHS Attorney Advisor		Privacy	staff level names, numbers, and emails.
								Pre-decisional communications containing legal
								analysis regarding legal memorandum on the
								public charge regulation between DHS Office of
		1					AWP - Work Product; ACP -	the General Counsel. Document reflects legal
							· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	advice, mental impressions of attorneys, and
		1		DHS Attornov Advisor Adit - 1-1			Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	AD 00200266	A.D. 00200265	7/44/2012	DHS Attorney Advisor; Mitnick,	Ma Danald Chairt			advice in anticipation of litigation. Also includes
	AR 00380366	AR_00380366	7/11/2019	ווווסרו	McDonald, Christina	i l	Privacy	staff level names, phone numbers, and emails.

					1	1	, ,	1
								Pre-decisional communications containing legal
								analysis regarding legal memorandum on the
								public charge regulation between DHS Office of
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	the General Counsel. Document reflects legal
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	advice, mental impressions of attorneys, and
							Deliberative Process; PII - Persona	advice in anticipation of litigation. Also includes
80	AR_00380367	AR_00380367	7/11/2019	Mitnick, John	DHS Attorney Advisor	McDonald, Christina	Privacy	staff level names, numbers, and emails.
								Memorandum from USCIS to DHS General
								Counsel regarding pre-decisional, deliberative
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	public charge rulemaking process provided for
81	AR_00380368	AR_00380368	7/11/2019	Mitnick, John	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy		Deliberative Process	the purpose of legal advice.
		_		-				Draft memorandum from USCIS to DHS General
								Counsel regarding pre-decisional, deliberative
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	public charge rulemaking process provided for
82	AR 00380369	AR 00380369	7/11/2019	Mitnick, John	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy		Deliberative Process	the purpose of legal advice.
			, ,		, , , , ,			Draft memorandum from USCIS to DHS General
								Counsel regarding pre-decisional, deliberative
				Mitnick, John; DHS Attorney			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	public charge rulemaking process provided for
83	AR 00380370	AR 00380370	7/10/2019		McDonald, Christina		Deliberative Process	the purpose of legal advice.
- 03	7411_00300370	7111_00300370	7/10/2013	71441501	WicDonald, Christina		Deliberative Frocess	Communications regarding legal advice on the
								public charge regulation between DHS Office of
								the General Counsel that reflects mental
								impressions of attorneys. Also includes staff
								level names, phone numbers, and emails. This
								communication contains pre-decisional and
								deliberative opinions, recommendations, and
						Baroukh, Nader; Deputy Associate	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	advice about agency decisions that have not yet
				McDonald, Christina; Fishman,		General Counsel; DHS Attorney	Deliberative Process; PII - Persona	*
84	AR_00380371	AR_00380371	7/9/2019	George; Mitnick, John	Mizelle, Chad	Advisors; Maher, Joseph	Privacy	addresses, and phone numbers.
								Communications regarding legal advice on the
								public charge regulation between DHS Office of
								the General Counsel that reflects mental
								impressions of attorneys. Also includes staff
								level names, numbers, and emails. This
								communication contains pre-decisional and
								deliberative opinions, recommendations, and
						Baroukh, Nader; Deputy Associate	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	advice about agency decisions that have not yet
				Fishman, George; Mitnick,		General Counsel; DHS Attorney	Deliberative Process; PII - Persona	been finalized. Includes staff level names, email
85	AR_00380372	AR_00380372	7/9/2019	John; Mizelle, Chad	McDonald, Christina	Advisors; Maher, Joseph	Privacy	addresses, and phone numbers.
								Communications regarding legal advice on the
								public charge regulation between DHS Office of
								the General Counsel that reflects mental
								impressions of attorneys. Also includes staff
								level names, numbers, and emails. This
								communication contains pre-decisional and
1						Baroukh, Nader; Deputy Associate		deliberative opinions, recommendations, and
1						General Counsel; DHS Attorney	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	advice about agency decisions that have not yet
				Fishman, George; Mitnick,		Advisors; Maher, Joseph; DHS		been finalized. Includes staff level names, email
96	AR 00380373	AR 00380373	7/0/2010		McDonald, Christina	Special Assistant	Privacy	addresses, and phone numbers.
86	An_00360373	An_00360373	7/9/2019	John, Mizelle, Chau	ivicoolidiu, Ciiristifid	Sheriai Assistatit	Privacy	audi esses, and priorie numbers.

87	AR_00380374	AR_00380374	7/9/2019	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George; Mizelle, Chad	McDonald, Christina	Baroukh, Nader; Deputy Associate General Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisors; Maher, Joseph; DHS Special Assistant	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	Communications regarding legal advice on the public charge regulation between DHS Office of the General Counsel that reflects mental impressions of attorneys. Also includes staff level names, numbers, and emails. This communication contains pre-decisional and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized. Includes staff level names, email addresses, and phone numbers. Interagency email communication regarding predecisional discussion regarding elements of the public charge rule. This rule also includes staff level names, phone numbers, and email
88	AR_00380375	AR_00380375	6/12/2018	USCIS Employee	USCIS Employee		 Personal Privacy	addresses.
90	AD 00200276	AD 0020075	7/2/2010	USCIS Employee; USCIS Associate Counsel; USCIS Associate Counsel; USCIS Employee; USCIS Employee; USCIS Employee; DHS Attorney Advisor; DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS Employee; USCIS Employee; USCIS Employee; DOS Employee; DOS Employee; USCIS Employee; USCIS				Staff-level pre-decisional working draft of
89	AR_00380376	AR_00380376	7/2/2019	Employee; USCIS Employee	USCIS Employee		Deliberative Process	portion of the final rule regulatory text.
				USCIS Employee; USCIS			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	Pre-decisional draft summary of the public
90	AR_00380377	AR_00380377	7/2/2019	Employee; USCIS Employee	USCIS Employee		Deliberative Process	charge totality of the circumstances framework.

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 15 of 26

								•
								Pre-decisional analysis of public benefits
								programs for potential consideration in the
								public charge rule. Contains questions about
						OMB employee; DHS Attorney		public benefits programs relevant to
						Advisor; USCIS Employee; HHS		determining whether benefits should be
						Employee; HHS Employee; HHS		included in the final rule, and responses from
91	AR 00380378	AR 00380378	4/5/2019	USCIS Employee	HHS Employee	Employee; HHS Employee	DP - Deliberative Process	HHS.
	7.1100300370	7.1100000070	1,3,2013	oscis ziiipioyee	Title Employee	zpioyee, i.i.s z.i.pioyee	D. Democrative Freeess	Pre-decisional analysis of public benefits
								programs for potential consideration in the
						LUIS Frankrises ONAD Frankrises		l. o .
				LUIS Freedom LUIS Freedom		HHS Employee; OMB Employee;		public charge rule. Contains questions about
				HHS Employee; HHS Employee;		DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS		public benefits programs relevant to
				HHS Employee; HHS Employee;		Employee; HHS Employee; HHS		determining whether benefits should be
92	AR_00380379	AR_00380379	3/20/2019	HHS Employee; HHS Employee	USCIS Employee	Employee; USCIS Employee	DP - Deliberative Process	included in the final rule.
								Pre-decisional analysis of public benefits
								programs for potential consideration in the
								public charge rule. Contains questions about
]				USCIS Employee; USCIS Employee;		public benefits programs relevant to
						DHS Attorney Advisor; OMB		determining whether benefits should be
93	AR_00380380	AR_00380380	4/1/2019	HHS Employee	USCIS Employee	Employee	DP - Deliberative Process	included in the final rule.
								Pre-decisional analysis of public benefits
								programs for potential consideration in the
								public charge rule. Contains questions about
								public benefits programs relevant to
								determining whether benefits should be
0.4	AR 00380381	AR 00380381	4/1/2019	USCIS Employee	HHS Employee		DP - Deliberative Process	included in the final rule.
34	AN_00300301	AN_00300301	4/1/2013	OSCIS Employee	TITIS Employee	DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS	Di - Deliberative i rocess	Predecisional deliberative email discussing
						Employee; USCIS Associate		affidavit of support requirement relating to
						Counsel; USCIS Associate Counsel;	ACD Attacase Client Debits on DD	public charge inadmissibility rule; includes a
						USCIS Employee; DHS Attorney	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	request for information for the purposes of legal
						Advisor; USCIS Employee; USCIS	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	advice. Contains email addresses and names of
95	AR_00380382	AR_00380382	3/25/2019	USCIS Employee	DOS Employee	Employee	Privacy	staff-level employees.
						DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS		Predecisional deliberative email discussing
						Employee; USCIS Associate		affidavit of support requirement relating to
						Counsel; USCIS Associate Counsel;		public charge inadmissibility rule; includes a
						USCIS Employee; DHS Attorney	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	request for information for the purposes of legal
						Advisor; USCIS Employee; USCIS	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	advice. Contains email addresses and names of
96	AR_00380383	AR_00380383	3/25/2019	DOS Employee	USCIS Employee	Employee	Privacy	staff-level employees
								Predecisional deliberative email discussing
								affidavit of support requirement relating to
								public charge inadmissibility rule; includes a
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	request for information for the purposes of legal
								advice. Contains email addresses and names of
97	AR 00380384	AR 00380384	3/25/2019	USCIS Employee	DOS Employee		Privacy	staff-level employees.
			.,,,			+	,	Pre-decisional analysis of public benefits
								programs for potential consideration in the
								public charge rule. Contains questions about
						HHS Employees OMB Employees		i
				LUIC Faralance LUIC Faralance		HHS Employee; OMB Employee;		public benefits programs relevant to
-00	AD 0020020E	AD 00200205	2/20/2040	HHS Employee; HHS Employee;	LICCIC Faradamaa	DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS	DD. Dalibarativa Drasacc	determining whether benefits should be
98	AR_00380385	AR_00380385	3/20/2019	HHS Employee	USCIS Employee	Employee; USCIS Employee	DP - Deliberative Process	included in the final rule.

	1			I	ı			
								Pre-decisional deliberative email between HHS
								and USCIS regarding public comments about
								public benefits programs for potential
				HHS Employee; USCIS				consideration in the public charge rule. Contain
				Employee; HHS Employee; HHS			DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	names and e-mail addresses of government
99	AR_00380386	AR_00380386	3/11/2019	Employee	HHS Employee;	HHS Employee	Personal Privacy	officials, some of whom are not senior officials.
								Pre-decisional deliberative email between HHS
								and USCIS regarding public comments about
								public benefits programs for potential
						HHS Employee; USCIS Employee;		consideration in the public charge rule. Contain
						USCIS Employee; DHS Attorney	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	names and e-mail addresses of government
100	AR 00380387	AR 00380387	3/1/2019	USCIS Employee	HHS Employee;	Advisor; OMB Employee	Personal Privacy	officials, some of whom are not senior officials
	_	_					·	Pre-decisional and deliberative document
						HHS Employee; USCIS Employee;		providing HHS response to questions from USC
						USCIS Employee; DHS Attorney		concerning public benefits under consideration
101	AR 00380388	AR 00380388	3/1/2019	USCIS Employee	HHS Employee;	Advisor; OMB Employee	DP - Deliberative Process	for inclusion in the public charge rule.
			-,,	, , , , ,	1, 1, 1, 1,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		Draft response to certain public comments
								about the Rule containing redlined edits. Also
								contains questions for the Department of State
						DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS		concerning public charge issues, and State's
				USCIS Employee; DOS		Employee; OMB Employee; USCIS	ACD Attornoy Client Brigilage, DB	responses, including attorney comments
102	AR 00380389	AR 00380389	2/5/2010	Employee	DOS Employee		Deliberative Process	
102	AK_00360369	AK_00360369	3/3/2019	Employee	DOS Employee	Employee	Deliberative Process	conveying legal advice.
								Predecisional deliberative email between
								counsel at USCIS and counsel at State regarding
								DHS's intention to engage in public charge
							· ·	rulemaking. Contains employee email address
103	AR_00380390	AR_00380390	12/19/2017	DOS Employee	USCIS Employee	USCIS Employee	Privacy	and phone numbers.
								Predecisional deliberative email between
								counsel at USCIS and counsel at State regardin
							,	DHS's intention to engage in public charge
							· ·	rulemaking. Contains employee email address
104	AR_00380391	AR_00380391	12/19/2017	USCIS Employee	DOS Employee	USCIS Employee	Privacy	and phone numbers.
								Predecisional deliberative email between
								counsel at USCIS and counsel at State regardir
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	DHS's intention to engage in public charge
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	rulemaking. Contains employee email address
105	AR_00380392	AR_00380392	12/19/2017	DOS Employee	USCIS Employee	USCIS Employee	Privacy	and phone numbers.
								Predecisional deliberative email between
	1							counsel at USCIS and counsel at State regardin
	1	1					ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	DHS's intention to engage in public charge
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	rulemaking. Contains employee email address
106	AR 00380393	AR 00380393	12/18/2017	USCIS Employee	DOS Employee	USCIS Employee	Privacy	and phone numbers.
		_						Predecisional deliberative email between
								counsel at USCIS and counsel at State regarding
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege: DP	DHS's intention to engage in public charge
	1	1						rulemaking. Contains employee email address
107	AR 00380394	AR 00380394	12/15/2017	DOS Employee	USCIS Employee	USCIS Employee	Privacy	and phone numbers.
107	00300334	.111_00300354	12, 13, 2017	200 Employee	SSCIS Employee	COSIO Employee	i iivacy	Predecisional draft of the public charge rule
							ACB Attornoy Client Brivilege: DB	containing deliberative comments and
100	AR 00380395	AR 00380395	7/20/2010	OMB Employee	Mitnick, John		Deliberative Process	suggestions.
108	WU_00200222	WW_00200232	//30/2019	OWB LITIPIOYEE	IVIILIICK, JUIIII			
	1	1		Malas Basadar, Billi				Predecisional email conveying recommendation
	A.D. 00303335	A.D. 00000000	7/20/20:-	Wales, Brandon; Bobb,	A Albandada III. I	Pared Malaria		regarding promulgation of public charge rule.
109	AR_00380396	AR_00380396	7/28/2019	Christina	Mitnick, John	Boyd, Valerie	Privacy	Contains email addresses of federal employees

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 17 of 26

_	1				ı	1	1	
								Memorandum from DHS General Counsel to
				Maher, Joseph; Fishman,				Acting Secretary of Homeland Security regarding
				George; Mizelle, Chad;			AWP - Work Product; ACP -	public charge rule, containing recommendations
				McDonald, Christina; Baroukh,			Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and legal analysis regarding the Rule made in
110	AR_00380397	AR_00380397	7/17/2019	Nader	Mitnick, John		Deliberative Process	anticipation of litigation.
								Email chain between DHS OGC attorneys
								discussing the contents of a draft memorandum
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	regarding the public charge rule, and legal
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	analysis relating to the Rule, made in
						Mizelle, Chad; Fishman, George;	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	anticipation of litigation. Contains email
111	AR_00380398	AR_00380398	7/28/2019	McDonald, Christina	Mitnick, John	Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader	Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
								Email chain between DHS OGC attorneys
								discussing the contents of a draft memorandum
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	regarding the public charge rule, and legal
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	analysis relating to the Rule, made in
						Mizelle, Chad; Fishman, George;		anticipation of litigation. Contains email
112	AR 00380399	AR 00380399	7/28/2019	McDonald, Christina	Mitnick, John	Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader	Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
	7.11000000000	/	7,20,2013	ineseriala, emistina	Tritainen, seriii	maner, sesepin, saroanni, made.	i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i	Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS General Counsel and DHS leadership
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	regarding process for finalizing the public charge
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	rule and legal analysis concerning the rule made
							,	
112	AR 00380400	AR 00380400	7/27/2010	Wales, Brandon	Mitnick, John	Boyd, Valerie	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	in anticipation of litigation. Contains employee
113	AK_00380400	AK_00380400	//2//2019	wales, Brandon	Mithick, John		Privacy	email addresses and a phone number.
						Maher, Joseph; Fishman, George;		Predecisional deliberative email chain between
						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy	AWP - Work Product; ACP -	DHS OGC counsel regarding legal analysis of the
						Associate General Counsel; DHS	Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	public charge rule made in anticipation of
				McDonald, Christina; Mizelle,		Attorney Advisor; DHS Attorney		litigation. Contains email addresses and names
114	AR_00380401	AR_00380401	7/27/2019	Chad	Mitnick, John	Advisor; DHS Attorney Advisor	Privacy	of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS General Counsel and DHS leadership
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	regarding process for finalizing the public charge
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	rule and legal analysis concerning the rule made
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	in anticipation of litigation. Contains employee
115	AR_00380402	AR_00380402	7/27/2019	Wales, Brandon	Mitnick, John	Boyd, Valerie	Privacy	email addresses and phone numbers.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	DHS General Counsel and DHS leadership
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	regarding process for finalizing the public charge
116	AR_00380403	AR_00380403	7/26/2019	Wales, Brandon	Mitnick, John	Boyd, Valerie	Privacy	rule.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
						Mizelle, Chad; McDonald, Christina;		DHS OGC attorneys and senior management
						Fishman, George; Baroukh, Nader;		regarding timeline for finalizing the public charge
						DHS Deputy Associate General		rule and including a discussion regarding various
						Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	outstanding issues related to the Rule. Contains
						DHS Attorney Advisor; Maher,	,	employee email addresses and phone numbers
117	AR 00380404	AR 00380404	7/25/2019	DHS Attorney Advisor	Mitnick, John	Joseph	Privacy	and names of staff-level employees.
			. ,	, : ::	,	·	,	Predecisional deliberative email chain between
						Mizelle, Chad; McDonald, Christina;		DHS OGC attorneys and senior management
						Fishman, George; Baroukh, Nader;		regarding timeline for finalizing the public charge
						DHS Deputy Associate General		rule and including a discussion regarding various
						Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	outstanding issues related to the Rule. Contains
						DHS Attorney Advisor; Maher,	,	employee email addresses and phone numbers
110	AR 00380405	AR 00380405	7/23/2010	DHS Attorney Advisor	Mitnick, John	Joseph	Privacy	and names of staff-level employees.
119	AN_00360403	AN_00360403	1/23/2019	CITO ALLUTTICY AUVISUI	IVIICITICK, JUITI	nosehii	Filvacy	and names of stan-level employees.

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 18 of 26

					T	,		
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS OGC attorneys and senior management
								regarding timeline for finalizing the public charg
						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy		rule and including a discussion regarding various
				DHS Attorney Advisor; Mizelle,		Associate General Counsel; DHS	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	outstanding issues related to the Rule. Contains
				Chad; McDonald, Christina;		Attorney Advisor; DHS Attorney	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	employee email addresses and phone numbers
119	AR 00380406	AR 00380406	7/19/2019	Fishman, George	Mitnick, John	Advisor; Maher, Joseph	Privacy	and names of staff-level employees.
		_		DOS employee; DOS employee;			i i	Pre-decisional, deliberative draft of portion of
				DOS employee; USCIS		DOS employee; DOS employee;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	the public charge rule that was shared with DOS
120	AR 00380407	AR 00380407	7/2/2019	employee	USCIS employee	USCIS employee; USCIS employee	Deliberative Process	including with attorneys for legal review.
		_		• ,		. , , , , , , , ,		Pre-decisional draft document regarding totality
								of circumstances framework for public charge
				DOS employee; DOS employee;				inadmissibility determinations that was shared
				DOS employee; USCIS		DOS employee; DOS employee;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	with DOS, including with attorneys for legal
121	AR 00380408	AR 00380408	7/2/2019	employee	USCIS employee	USCIS employee; USCIS employee	Deliberative Process	review
121	AI_00380408	AN_00300408	7/2/2013	employee	oscis employee	oscis employee, oscis employee	Deliberative Frocess	
				DUC Attended Advisor UIIC				Predecisional deliberative email chain between
				DHS Attorney Advisor; HHS				DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
				employee; USCIS employee;				program to be included in the final rule, so that
				USCIS Associate Counsel; USCIS				DHS could respond to public comments on the
				Associate Counsel; DHS			,	proposed rule. Contains employee email
				Attorney Advisor; Shannon		HHS employee; HHS employee;		addresses and phone numbers, and names of
122	AR_00380409	AR_00380409	7/1/2019	Joyce	HHS employee	HHS employee	Privacy	staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
				HHS employee; HHS employee;				DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
				USCIS employee; USCIS				program to be included in the final rule, so that
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				DHS could respond to public comments on the
				Associate Counsel; DHS			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	proposed rule. Contains employee email
				Attorney Advisor; Shannon		HHS employee; HHS employee;	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	addresses and phone numbers, and names of
123	AR_00380410	AR_00380410	7/1/2019	Joyce	DHS Attorney Advisor	HHS employee	Privacy	staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
				DHS Attorney Advisor; HHS				DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
				employee; USCIS employee;				program to be included in the final rule, so that
				USCIS Associate Counsel; USCIS				DHS could respond to public comments on the
				Associate Counsel; DHS			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	proposed rule. Contains employee email
				Attorney Advisor; Shannon		HHS employee; HHS employee;		addresses and phone numbers, and names of
124	AR 00380411	AR 00380411	6/27/2019		HHS employee	HHS employee	Privacy	staff level employees.
124	7111_00300411	7111_00300411	0/2//2013	30,00	Titis employee	This employee	Tivacy	Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
				HUS amplayon USCIS				,
				HHS employee; USCIS				program to be included in the final rule, so that
				employee; USCIS Associate			ACD Attended Client British	DHS could respond to public comments on the
				Counsel; USCIS Associate				proposed rule. Contains employee email
			c /o= /oc : -	Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;		l		addresses and phone numbers, and names of
125	AR_00380412	AR_00380412	6/2//2019	Shannon Joyce	DHS Attorney Advisor	HHS employee; HHS employee	Privacy	staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
				DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS				program to be included in the final rule, so that
				employee; USCIS Associate				DHS could respond to public comments on the
				Counsel; USCIS Associate				proposed rule. Contains employee email
				Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;			Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	addresses and phone numbers, and names of
	AR 00380413	AR 00380413	C /27 /2010	Shannon Joyce	HHS employee	HHS employee; HHS employee	Privacy	staff level employees.

	-		1	1					
									Predecisional deliberative email chain between
									DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
					DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS				program to be included in the final rule, so that
					employee; USCIS Associate				DHS could respond to public comments on the
					Counsel; USCIS Associate			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	proposed rule. Contains employee email
					Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;			Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	addresses and phone numbers, and names of
	127	AR 00380414	AR 00380414	6/26/2019	Shannon Joyce	HHS employee		Privacy	staff level employees.
			_	, ,	•	. ,		,	Predecisional deliberative email chain between
									DHS/USCIS counsel and HHS discussing benefits
					HHS employee; USCIS				program to be included in the final rule, so that
					employee; USCIS Associate				DHS could respond to public comments on the
								ACD Attacas Client Driviless DD	
					Counsel; USCIS Associate			ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	proposed rule. Contains employee email
				6/06/0040	Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;				addresses and phone numbers, and names of
	128	AR_00380415	AR_00380415	6/26/2019	Shannon Joyce	DHS Attorney Advisor		Privacy	staff level employees.
									Predecisional deliberative email in which DHS
					HHS employee; USCIS				counsel seeks guidance from HHS regarding
					employee; USCIS Associate				benefits program to be included in the final rule,
					Counsel; USCIS Associate			, , , ,	so that DHS could respond to public comments
					Counsel; DHS Attorney Advisor;			Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	on the proposed rule. Contains names of staff
	129	AR_00380416	AR_00380416	6/26/2019	Shannon Joyce	DHS Attorney Advisor		Privacy	level employees.
									Predecisional deliberative email in which DHS
									counsel seeks guidance from HHS regarding
							Shannon Joyce; USCIS employee;		benefits program to be included in the final rule,
							USCIS Associate Counsel; USCIS	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	so that DHS could respond to public comments
							Associate Counsel; DHS Attorney	,	on the proposed rule. Contains names of staff
	130	AR 00380417	AR 00380417	6/19/2019	HHS employee	DHS Attorney Advisor	Advisor	Privacy	level employees.
	100			0, 20, 2020					Pre-decisional draft version of portion of the
					DOS employee; DOS employee;		USCIS employee; DHS Attorney	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	final rule shared with DOS, including with
	121	AR 00380418	AR 00380418	6/17/2019		USCIS employee	Advisor	Deliberative Process	attorneys for legal review.
	131	AN_00300418	AN_00380418	0/17/2013	DOS employee	OSCIS employee	Advisor	Deliberative Frocess	Predecisional deliberative email chain between
							USDA employee; Cohen, Jeff; USDA		USDA officials and USCIS economist discussing
									S
							employee; USDA employee; Lyons,		data about public benefits programs included in
							Maggie; Giles, Misty; USDA		the rule, for use in making policy decisions.
							employee; Adcock, Rebeckah; DHS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	Contains employee phone numbers and email
	132	AR_00380419	AR_00380419	5/15/2019	Shahin, Jessica	USCIS employee	Attorney Advisor; USCIS employee	Personal Privacy	addresses, and names of staff-level employees.
1					USCIS employee; USDA				Predecisional deliberative email chain between
					employee; Cohen, Jeff; USDA				USDA officials and USCIS economist discussing
					employee; USDA employee				data about public benefits programs included in
					Lyons, Maggie; Giles, Misty;				the rule, for use in making policy decisions.
					USDA employee; Adcock,		DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	Contains employee phone numbers and email
	133	AR_00380420	AR_00380420	5/15/2019	Rebeckah	Shahin, Jessica	employee	Personal Privacy	addresses, and names of staff-level employees.
					USCIS employee; USDA				Predecisional deliberative email chain between
					employee; Cohen, Jeff; USDA				USDA officials and USCIS economist discussing
					employee; USDA employee;				data about public benefits programs included in
					Lyons, Maggie; Giles, Misty;				the rule, for use in making policy decisions.
					USDA employee; Adcock,		DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	Contains employee phone numbers and email
	13/	AR 00380421	AR 00380421	5/14/2019		Shahin, Jessica	employee	Personal Privacy	addresses, and names of staff-level employees.
	104	/1100300421	/00300421	3/14/2019		onami, ressica	cinpioyee	1 CI SOTIAL I TIVACY	Predecisional deliberative email chain between
					USDA employee; Shahin,				
					Jessica; Cohen, Jeff; USDA				USDA officials and USCIS economist discussing
					employee; USDA employee;				data about public benefits programs included in
					Lyons, Maggie; Giles, Misty;				the rule, for use in making policy decisions.
					USDA employee; Adcock,		DHS Attorney Advisor; USCIS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	Contains employee phone numbers and email
1	135	AR_00380422	AR_00380422	5/13/2019	Rebeckah	USCIS employee	employee	Personal Privacy	addresses, and names of staff-level employees.

	,	,	1		•			
				USCIS employee; Shahin,				
				Jessica; Cohen, Jeff; USDA				
				employee; USDA employee;				
				USCIS employee; USCIS				
				employee; USCIS employee;				
				USCIS employee; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				
				· ·				
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; Lyons,				
				Maggie; Giles, Misty; USDA				
				employee; Adcock, Rebeckah;				Duadaciais and deliberative assail about between
				Shannon Joyce; DHS Attorney				Predecisional deliberative email chain between
				Advisor; USCIS employee;				DHS, USDA, and OMB regarding input from
				USCIS employee; USCIS			DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	USDA regarding public benefits considered by
126	AD 00200422	AD 00200422	2/20/2010	employee; USCIS employee;	LICDA amalassa	LISDA amalaura	,	the public charge rule. Contains employee email
136	AR_00380423	AR_00380423	3/29/2019	' '	USDA employee	USDA employee	Personal Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
				USCIS employee; USCIS				
				employee; USCIS employee;				
				USCIS employee; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; USCIS				
				Associate Counsel; Lyons,				
				Maggie; Giles, Misty; USDA				
				employee; Adcock, Rebeckah;				
				OMB employee; DHS Attorney				Predecisional deliberative email chain between
				Advisor; USCIS employee;				DHS, USDA, and OMB regarding input from
				USCIS employee; USCIS				USDA regarding public benefits considered by
				employee; USCIS employee;			DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	the public charge rule. Contains employee email
137	AR_00380424	AR_00380424	3/28/2019	USCIS employee	USCIS employee		Personal Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
						USDA employee; Giles, Misty;		DHS, USDA, and OMB regarding input from
						Adcock, Rebeckah; DHS Attorney		USDA regarding public benefits considered by
						Advisor; Shannon Joyce; USCIS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	the public charge rule. Contains employee email
138	AR_00380425	AR_00380425	3/28/2019	Lyons, Maggie	USCIS employee	employee	Personal Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
]		1		USDA employee; Giles, Misty;		DHS, USDA, and OMB regarding input from
						Adcock, Rebeckah; DHS Attorney		USDA regarding public benefits considered by
						Advisor; Shannon Joyce; USCIS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	the public charge rule. Contains employee email
139	AR_00380426	AR_00380426	3/28/2019	Lyons, Maggie	USCIS employee	employee	Personal Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS, USDA, and OMB regarding input from
				USCIS employee; USDA				USDA regarding public benefits considered by
				employee; Giles, Misty; Adcock,		DHS Attorney Advisor; Shannon	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	the public charge rule. Contains employee email
	AR 00380427	AR 00380427	3/28/2019	Rebeckah	Lyons, Maggie	Joyce; USCIS employee	Personal Privacy	addresses and names of staff level employees.
140	AR_00380427	_						
140	AR_00380427	_						Pre-decisional document containing questions
140	AR_00380427	_		USDA employee; Giles, Misty;		DHS Attorney Advisor; Shannon		from USCIS for USDA about the public benefits
	AR_00380427	AR 00380428	3/20/2019	Lyons, Maggie; Adcock,	USCIS employee	DHS Attorney Advisor; Shannon Joyce; USCIS employee; USCIS employee	DP - Deliberative Process	

		1			1	1		
								Email containing deliberations among DHS
								employees and employees of other agencies
								regarding public benefits considered under the
				USDA employee; Giles, Misty;		DHS Attorney Advisor; Shannon		public charge rule. Email chain containing names
				Lyons, Maggie; Adcock,		Joyce; USCIS employee; USCIS	DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	and e-mail addresses of government officials,
142	AR_00380429	AR_00380429	3/20/2019	Rebeckah	USCIS employee	employee	Personal Privacy	some of whom are not senior officials.
								Predecisional deliberative document containing
				USDA employee; Giles, Misty;		DHS Attorney Advisor; Shannon		questions from USCIS to USDA concerning public
				Lyons, Maggie; Adcock,		Joyce; USCIS employee; USCIS		benefits potentially relevant to proposed public
143	AR_00380430	AR_00380430	3/20/2019	Rebeckah	USCIS employee	employee	DP - Deliberative Process	charge rule.
								Email discussion reflecting legal advice and
								analysis regarding the public charge rule. The
								email was prepared in anticipation of litigation.
								It contains a pre-decisional deliberative
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	discussion regarding recommendations and
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	advice pertaining to the public charge rule.
						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Attorney	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	Contains employee phone numbers and staff-
144	AR_00380431	AR_00380431	8/31/2018	Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph	Fishman, George	Advisor	Privacy	level names.
								Email discussion reflecting legal advice and
								analysis regarding the public charge rule. The
								email was prepared in anticipation of litigation.
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	It contains a pre-decisional deliberative
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	discussion regarding recommendations and
						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Attorney	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	advice pertaining to the public charge rule.
145	AR_00380432	AR_00380432	8/31/2018	Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph	Fishman, George	Advisor	Privacy	Contains employee phone numbers.
								This email reflects provision of legal advice to
								agency leadership by attorneys upon request.
								This email contains a pre-decisional deliberative
						Fishman, George; DHS Attorney		conversation regarding recommendations and
						Advisor; DHS Attorney Advisor;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	advice pertaining to agency regulations. This
						Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; USCIS	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	email contains employee phone numbers and
146	AR 00380433	AR 00380433	8/29/2018	Shah, Dimple	Ray, Paul	employee; Mitnick, John	Privacy	the names of staff-level employees.
		_		•			·	This email reflects provision of legal advice to
								agency leadership by attorneys upon request.
								This email contains a pre-decisional deliberative
						Fishman, George; DHS Attorney		conversation regarding recommendations and
						Advisor; DHS Attorney Advisor;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	advice pertaining to agency regulations. This
						Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; USCIS		email contains employee phone numbers and
147	AR 00380434	AR 00380434	8/29/2018	Ray, Paul	Shah, Dimple	employee; Mitnick, John	Privacy	the names of staff-level employees.
		_		**			,	Email contains internal pre-decisional
								discussions among DHS, FEMA, and TSA counsel
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	regarding legal work surrounding the rule and
148	AR_00380435	AR_00380435	7/11/2018	Mitnick, John	Chang, Hayley		Deliberative Process	impacts of the rule on other regulatory efforts.
								Predecisional deliberative email between DHS
								counsel and OMB discussing interagency
						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	comments on notice of proposed rulemaking.
				Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph;		Associate Counsel; DHS Attorney	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	Contains employee email address and phone
149	AR_00380436	AR_00380436	5/9/2018	Shah, Dimple	McDonald, Christina	Advisor	Privacy	numbers, and names of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative document containing
						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy		USDA comments and recommendations
				Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph;		Associate Counsel; DHS Attorney	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	regarding various aspects of proposed public
150	AR_00380437	AR_00380437	4/17/2018	Shah, Dimple	McDonald, Christina	Advisor	Deliberative Process	charge rule, provided to DHS counsel.
150	AR_00380437	AR_00380437	4/17/2018	Shah, Dimple	McDonald, Christina	Advisor	Deliberative Process	charge rule, provided to DHS counsel.

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 22 of 26

						Baroukh, Nader; DHS Deputy		Predecisional deliberative draft notice of
				Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph;		Associate Counsel; DHS Attorney	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	proposed rulemaking containing redlined edits
151	AR 00380438	AR 00380438	5/8/2018	Shah, Dimple	McDonald, Christina	Advisor	Deliberative Process	and comments.
		_		,				This email contains a pre-decisional deliberative
								conversation regarding recommendations and
								advice pertaining to agency regulations. This pr
								decisional draft document contains information
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	reflecting advice provided by counsel. Also
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	includes email addresses, phone numbers, and
152	AR_00380439	AR_00380439	7/27/2019	Mitnick, John	Mizelle, Chad		Privacy	staff-level names.
								This email contains a pre-decisional deliberative
								conversation regarding recommendations and
								advice pertaining to agency regulations. This pro
								decisional draft document contains information
				McDonald, Christina; Fishman,		Mizelle, Chad; DHS Attorney	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	reflecting advice provided by counsel. Also
				George; Glabe, Scott; Maher,		Advisor; DHS OGC Economist;		includes email addresses, phone numbers, and
153	AR_00380440	AR_00380440	7/26/2019	Joseph; Mitnick, John	Wales, Brandon	Baroukh, Nader	Privacy	staff-level names.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS counsel and DHS leadership discussing a
						Gountanis, John; Fishman, George;		draft insert for the proposed rule. Contains lega
						Mitnick, John; Maher, Joseph;		advice concerning the rulemaking. Contains
454	AD 00200444	AD 00300444	0/40/2040	Chart Taran	Ma Danadal Chairtina	Baroukh, Nader; DHS Attorney		employee email addresses and phone numbers
154	AR_00380441	AR_00380441	9/18/2018	Short, Tracy	McDonald, Christina	Advisor	Privacy	and names of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS counsel and DHS leadership discussing a
						Fishman, George; Mitnick, John;	ACD Attended Client Drivilene DD	draft insert for the proposed rule. Contains lega advice concerning the rulemaking. Contains
				McDonald, Christina;		Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader;	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	employee email addresses and phone numbers,
155	AR 00380442	AR 00380442	9/18/2018	Gountanis, John	Short, Tracy	DHS Attorney Advisor	Privacy	and names of staff level employees.
133	711_00300442	7111_00300442	3/10/2010	Godinariis, soriii	Short, macy	Dis recomey revisor	Trivacy	Predecisional deliberative email from DHS
								counsel to DHS leadership discussing a draft
								insert for the proposed rule. Contains legal
						Fishman, George; Mitnick, John;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege: DP	advice concerning the rulemaking. Contains
						Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader;		employee email addresses and phone numbers
156	AR_00380443	AR_00380443	9/18/2018	Short, Tracy; Gountanis, John	McDonald, Christina	DHS Attorney Advisor	Privacy	and names of staff level employees.
						Fishman, George; Mitnick, John;		Deliberative, pre-decisional draft insert for
						Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	notice of proposed rulemaking, prepared by
157	AR_00380444	AR_00380444	9/18/2018	Short, Tracy; Gountanis, John	McDonald, Christina	DHS Attorney Advisor	Deliberative Process	counsel.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS counsel and DHS leadership discussing
								potential changes to notice of proposed
								rulemaking and a proposed path forward for
								finalizing the notice. Contains employee email
							· ·	addresses and phone numbers, and names of
158	AR_00380445	AR_00380445	9/18/2018	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Maher, Joseph	Privacy	staff-level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain between
								DHS counsel and DHS leadership discussing
		1						potential changes to notice of proposed
								rulemaking and a proposed path forward for
						Fishman, George; Baroukh, Nader;	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	finalizing the notice. Contains employee email
	AD 00202112	A.D. 002222115	0/40/20:-	A Albertale I alice	DUG ALL	McDonald, Christina; DHS Deputy		addresses and phone numbers, and names of
159	AR_00380446	AR_00380446	9/18/2018	Mitnick, John	DHS Attorney Advisor	Associate Counsel	Privacy	staff-level employees.

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 23 of 26

160	AR_00380447	AR_00380447	9/17/2018	Mitnick, John	McDonald, Christina	Maher, Joseph; Baroukh, Nader; DHS Attorney Advisor; Fishman, George	, , ,	Predecisional deliberative email between DHS counsel discussing a potential revision to the public charge rule and offering legal advice regarding the proposed change. Contains employee phone numbers and email addresses, and names of staff level employees.
161	AR_00380448	AR_00380448	7/17/2019	DHS Executive Assistant	Mitnick, John		AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Pre-decisional, draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel to Acting Secretary of Homeland Security regarding public charge rule, containing recommendations and legal analysis regarding the Rule made in anticipation of litigation.
162	AR_00380449	AR_00380449	7/17/2019	Wales, Brandon; Bobb, Christina	Mitnick, John	Boyd, Valerie	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft, pre-decisional memorandum from DHS General Counsel to Acting Secretary of Homeland Security regarding public charge rule, containing recommendations and legal analysis regarding the Rule made in anticipation of litigation.
163	AR_00380450	AR_00380450	7/5/2019	Wales, Brandon	Cuccinelli, Ken			Email containing a pre-decisional deliberative discussion between DHS and USCIS leadership containing recommendations and deliberations regarding the rulemaking process, including discussion of legal advice from attorneys. Contains email address and phone number of federal employees.
164	AR_00380451	AR_00380451	4/19/2019	Wales, Brandon	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy	Gountanis, John	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP Deliberative Process; PII - Personal Privacy	Predecisional, deliberative email discussion between DHS counsel and DHS and USCIS officials regarding timeline for public charge rulemaking, containing recommendations regarding the timeline.
165	AR_00380452	AR_00380452	7/29/2019	Wales, Brandon	DHS Employee	ESEC-Internal Liaison; Bobb, Christina; DHS Employee	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft memorandum from DHS General Counsel to the Acting Secretary containing legal advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental impressions and legal advice in anticipation of litigation. This document contains pre-decisional and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized.
166	AR_00380453	AR_00380453	7/29/2019	Wales, Brandon	DHS Employee	ESEC-Internal Liaison; Bobb, Christina; DHS Employee	AWP - Work Product; ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP - Deliberative Process	Draft memorandum from USCIS Acting Chief Counsel to DHS Deputy General Counsel containing legal advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental impressions and legal advice in anticipation of litigation. This document contains pre-decisional and deliberative opinions, recommendations, and advice about agency decisions that have not yet been finalized.

						1		Memorandum from DHS General Counsel to the
								Acting Secretary containing legal advice
								regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
								litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
							ANAID NAIdeals Date disease ACD	
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
1.0	7		7/00/0040				Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and advice about agency decisions that have not
16	7 AR_00380454	AR_00380454	7/29/2019	Wales, Brandon	DHS Employee		Deliberative Process	yet been finalized.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain discussing
								resources for public charge rulemaking and
								timeline for finalizing the rule. Contains
							DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	employee email addresses and phone numbers
16	8 AR_00380455	AR_00380455	2/2/2019	Wales, Brandon	Gountanis, John		Personal Privacy	and names of staff level employees.
								Predecisional deliberative email chain discussing
								resources for public charge rulemaking and
								timeline for finalizing the rule. Contains
							DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	employee email addresses and phone numbers
16	9 AR_00380456	AR_00380456	2/2/2019	Wales, Brandon	Gountanis, John		Personal Privacy	and names of staff level employees.
								Pre-decisional deliberative communications
								discussing resources for public charge
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	rulemaking, timeline for finalizing the rule, as
				Wales, Brandon; Gountanis,			Deliberative Process; PII - Persona	I well as legal considerations regarding the rule.
17	O AR_00380457	AR_00380457	1/31/2019	John	Wolf, Chad	Taylor, Miles; DHS Employee	Privacy	Contains employee phone numbers.
								Predecisional, deliberative email among DHS
							DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	leadership discussing options for moving forward
17	1 AR_00380458	AR_00380458	7/11/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Wales, Brandon		Personal Privacy	with public charge rulemaking.
								Draft memorandum from DHS Deputy General
								Counsel to the Acting Secretary containing legal
								advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
						DHS Attorney Advisor; DHS		litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
						Attorney Advisor; Browne, Rene;	AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
						Baroukh, Nader; Maher, Joseph;	Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and advice about agency decisions that have not
17	2 AR 00380459	AR 00380459	6/29/2019	McDonald, Christina	Mizelle, Chad	Mitnick, John; Fishman, George	Deliberative Process	yet been finalized.
				·				Pre-decisional, deliberative communications
			1					regarding aspects of the public charge rule
								containing pre-decisional, deliberative
			1					recommendations from the Office of Civil Rights
			1					-
						Browne, Rene; Mina, Peter; DHS	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DF	and Civil Liberties and including legal advice. The
			1			Employee; DHS Employee; Mizelle,	- Deliberative Process; PII -	email also contains email addresses, phone
17	3 AR_00380460	AR_00380460	6/22/2019	McDonald, Christina	Quinn, Cameron	Chad	Personal Privacy	numbers, and staff-level names.
								Pre-decisional, deliberative document regarding
								aspects of the public charge rule containing pre-
			1					decisional, deliberative recommendations from
								the Office of Civil Rights and Civil Liberties, sent
			1				,	for the purposes of seeking legal advice. The
						Mina, Peter; DHS Employee;	- Deliberative Process; PII -	email also contains email addresses, phone
17	4 AR_00380461	AR_00380461	6/21/2019	Quinn, Cameron	McDonald, Christina	Browne, Rene; Mizelle, Chad	Personal Privacy	numbers, and staff-level names.

		1	1		1	,		
								Draft memorandum from DHS Deputy General
								Counsel to the Acting Secretary containing legal
								advice regarding the Rule and attorney mental
								impressions and legal advice in anticipation of
								litigation. This document contains pre-decisional
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and deliberative opinions, recommendations,
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	and advice about agency decisions that have not
175	AR_00380462	AR_00380462	7/1/2019	DHS Attorney Advisor	Mizelle, Chad		Deliberative Process	yet been finalized.
								Deliberative, pre-decisional email circulating
								draft portions of and policy considerations
								regarding the public charge rule, as well as legal
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	analysis of those changes. The email also
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	contains email addresses, phone numbers, and
176	AR_00380463	AR_00380463	5/15/2019	Mizelle, Chad	DHS Attorney Advisor	McDonald, Christina	Privacy	staff-level names.
								Deliberative, pre-decisional email circulating
						Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Symons,		policy considerations regarding the public charge
						Craig M; McDonald, Christina;	ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	rule, as well as legal analysis of those changes.
						USCIS Associate Counsel; DHS	Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	The email also contains email addresses, phone
177	AR_00380464	AR_00380464	5/15/2019	Mizelle, Chad	DHS Attorney Advisor	Attorney Advisor	Privacy	numbers, and staff-level names.
								Deliberative, pre-decisional email between
								senior agency counsel dicusssing legal advice
							AWP - Work Product; ACP -	and considerations regarding the public charge
							Attorney Client Privilege; DP -	rule, including in anticipation of litigation. The
							Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	email includes phone numbers and email
178	AR_00380465	AR_00380465	5/14/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Symons, Craig M	Fishman, George	Privacy	addresses.
								Pre-decisional, deliberative communications
								regarding aspects of the public charge rule
								containing pre-decisional, deliberative
								recommendations from the Office of Civil Rights
								and Civil Liberties. The email also contains email
							DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	addresses, phone numbers, and staff-level
179	AR 00380466	AR 00380466	7/30/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Wales, Brandon		Personal Privacy	names.
		_						Pre-decisional, deliberative communications
								regarding aspects of the public charge rule
								containing pre-decisional, deliberative
								recommendations from the Office of Civil Rights
								and Civil Liberties. The email also contains email
							DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	addresses, phone numbers, and staff-level
180	AR 00380467	AR 00380467	7/30/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Nichols, Kate		Personal Privacy	names.
200			,,,	/	,		,	Pre-decisional, deliberative communications
								regarding aspects of the public charge rule
								containing pre-decisional, deliberative
								recommendations from the Office of Civil Rights
								and Civil Liberties. The email also contains email
							DP - Deliberative Process; PII -	addresses, phone numbers, and staff-level
181	AR 00380468	AR 00380468	7/30/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Boyd, Valerie		Personal Privacy	names.
131	00000400	00000-000	.,55,2515		74, 14.0.10		. Elsonai i i i acy	Pre-decisional deliberative communications
								discussing resources for public charge
								rulemaking, timeline for finalizing the rule, as
							ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	well as legal considerations regarding the rule.
								Contains employee email addresses and phone
187	AR 00380469	AR 00380469	4/17/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Stein, Lesley		Privacy	numbers and names of staff level employees.
102	00300403	,00330403	7/1//2013	·····zeiic, ciida	occini, Ecoloy		ivacy	names and names of stall level employees.

Case 1:19-cv-07777-GBD-OTW Document 213-2 Filed 09/14/20 Page 26 of 26

Γ									Pre-decisional deliberative communications
									discussing resources for public charge
									rulemaking, timeline for finalizing the rule, as
								ACP - Attorney Client Privilege; DP	well as legal considerations regarding the rule.
								Deliberative Process; PII - Personal	Contains employee email addresses and phone
	183	AR_00380470	AR_00380470	4/17/2019	Mizelle, Chad	Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy		Privacy	numbers and names of staff level employees.